UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
31761 06104581 1

MEDIA AND DEFAMATION LAW

(LAW 369H1S)

Bert Bruser and Paul Schabas

CASES AND MATERIALS

(2010 – 2011)

VOLUME I

21827281.4

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

JAN - 3 2011

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

MEDIA AND DEFAMATION LAW

(LAW 369H1S)

Bert Bruser and Paul Schabas

CASES AND MATERIALS

(2010 – 2011)

VOLUME I

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/mediadefamationl01brus_0

MEDIA AND DEFAMATION LAW

(LAW 369H1S)

Bert Bruser and Paul Schabas

CASES AND MATERIALS

(2010-2011)

CONTENTS **PAGE**

VOLUME I - LIBEL

1. What is defamatory and who can sue? 1
Robertson & Nicol, *Media Law*, excerpts.....2
Youssoupoff v. Metro-Goldwyn-Mayer Pictures Ltd (1934), 50 TLR 581 (C.A.).....9
"Why are so many gays still hiding in the closet?" 14
Correction "Columnist meant to say singer supports equality".....15
"Racial slur rocks Liberal candidate" 16
"'Son of a bitch' not libellous; 'sick son of a bitch' is".....17
"Nic At Nite: A tale of hooters and heifers in old Hogtown".....18
"Order your drink and duck, dope".....25
"Dorothy Parsons clenched the sink"... 26
Lewis v. Daily Telegraph Ltd [1963] 2 ALL ER 151 27
"Singled out".....35
Gauthier v. Toronto Star (2003), 228 D.L.R (4th) 748 (Sup. Ct.), aff'd (2004)
45 D.L.R. (4th) 169 (C.A.).....37
"Group Libel": Discussion of *Malhab v. Diffusion Metromedia CMR Inc.,* 2008 QCCA 1938,
leave to appeal to S.C.C. granted (case no. 32931) 44
Montague (Township) v. Page (2006), 79 O.R. (3d) 515 (Sup. Ct.).....46
"Tenants seek ouster of priest, directors" 55

2. Defences to Libel **56**
(a) Truth/Justification **57**
"Steel Company Probed by Anti-Racket Squad".....58
"Police chief for Niagara not picked: Commission".....59
Sidorsky v. CFCN Communications Ltd (1994), 23 Alta. L.R. (3d) 116.....60
PG Restaurant Ltd v. Northern Interior Health Board, 38 B.C.L.R. 77, 2005 BCCA 210 61

(b) Fair Comment **74**
Excerpt from *Toronto Star* Column by Joey Slinger.....75
"Paradise lost at Passe Muraille – First-night theatre-goers says things went all to pot".....76
Transcript of CKNW broadcast, October 25, 1999 77
WIC Radio, et al. v. Kari Simpson, 2008 SCC 40 79
"Conspiracy" cartoon by Josh Beutel 103

Associated Newspapers Ltd. v. Keith Burstein, [2007] EWCA Civ 600 104
Eye Weekly, July 23 and 30, 1998 114

(c) Privilege 116
"Developer ordered to clean up land near houses" 117
"Woman sues orphanage nuns" 118
"Executive sold secrets to CIA" 119
"Roedica" article 120
McCarton Turkington Breen v. Times Newspapers, [2001] 2 AC 277 122

(d) Qualified Privilege and Responsible Communication 131
New York Times Co. v Sullivan, 376 U.S. 254 (1964) 132
Hill v. Church of Scientology, [1995] 2 S.C.R. 1130 158
"Saudi Officials Monitor Certain Bank Accounts – Focus is on Those With Potential Terrorist Ties" 193
Jameel v. Wall Street Journal, [2007] 1 AC 359 195
Flood v. Times Newspapers Ltd,. [2010] EWCA Civ 804 219
Grant v. Torstar Corp., 2009 SCC 61 242
"Adam Giambrone says sorry for relationship with young woman" 273
"Former MP Rahim Jaffer connected to alleged conman" 275
Nazim Gillani Libel Notice 279
"Ruby Dhalla's nanny trouble" 282
"Conviction tossed out over 'police brutality'" 285
"Officer breaks 'little' accountant's arm, but no charges laid 288

3. Malice 291
Horrocks v. Lowe, [1975] AC 135 (HL) 292
Paul v. Cheng, [2000] 4 HKC 1 (HK) 301

4. Apologies/Corrections 317
Murray Alter's Talent Associates Ltd. v. Toronto Star Newspapers Ltd., [1995] 124 D.L.R. (4th) 105 318
Sun Media Retraction and Apology to George Soros 334

5. Damages 335
Hill v. Church of Scientology, [1995] 2 S.C.R. 1130 336
Skene and Cooke, Canadian Defamation Verdicts 349

6. Defamation and the Internet 360
Bunt v. Tilley, [2006] EWHC 407 (Q.B.) 361
Zeran v. America Online, 129 F.3d 327 (1997, 7th Cir.) 369
Carter v. B.C. Federation of Foster Parents Assn. [2004] BCJ No. 192 (S.C.) 376
Carter v. B.C. Federation of Foster Parents Assn. [2005] BCJ No. 1720 (C.A.) 381
Times Newspapers (Nos. 1 and 2) v. U.K., [2009] ECHR 3002/03 383
Crookes v. Newton, 2009 BCCA 392, leave to appeal to S.C.C. granted (case no. 33412) 395

Barrick Gold Corp. v. Lopehandia [2004] O.J. No. 2329 (CA) 429
Smith v. ADVFN plc, [2008] EWHC 1797 436
"Internet chat more likely slander than libel, says High Court" 438
"Mosley orgy judge blocks web forum libel writ onslaught" 440
"Eatery now 'generally clean,' says health inspector" 443
"'Officer Bubbles' launches suit against YouTube 450
"Helping towns cope with sprawl" 451
"The longtail of news: to unpublish or not to unpublish" 454
Dow Jones & Co. v. Gutnick (2002), 210 C.L.R. 575 (HCA) 476
Bangoura v. Washington Post (2005), 258 D.L.R. (4th) 341 (Ont C.A.) 496
Black v. Breeden, 2010 ONCA 547 507
U.S. *SPEECH Act,* H.R. 2765 (2010) 535
"A national disgrace, a global menace, and a pre-democratic anachronism" 539
"Libel Without Borders" 542

7. Privacy 543
Vice-Versa magazine, June 1988 544
Mosley v. News Group Newspapers, [2008] EWHC 1777 (Q.B.) 545
"Max Mosley goes forum shopping in Paris," *The Independent*, 4 June 2008 556
Nitsopoulos v. Wong, 2008 CanLii 45407 (Ont. Sup. Ct.) 558
"Google Street View worries privacy experts" 562
"Google contravened Canadian privacy law, investigation finds," Office of the Privacy Commissioner of Canada 564
"Seniors at risk in retirement home, investigation reveals" 567

8. Legislation and Jury Charge 570
Libel and Slander Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. L.12 571
Defamation Bill, House of Lords 2010-2011 Sess., 2010 (1st reading 26 May 2010) 576
"What does Lord Lester's defamation bill propose?" *The Guardian*, 27 May 2010 591
Jury Charge – Hadjor Ats Soo Today and Police Services Board (Koke J.) 595

VOLUME II - NEWSGATHERING

9. Open Courts 621
Edmonton Journal v. Alberta, [1989] 2 S.C.R. 1326 622

10. Publication Bans 639
"Gagged" (Tori Stafford murder case) 640
"Karla Teale convicted" 642
Dagenais v. CBC, [1994] 3 S.C.R. 835 644
R. v. Mentuck, 2001 SCC 76, [2001] 3 S.C.R. 442, ...660
Toronto Star Newspapers Ltd. v. Ontario, [2005] 2 S.C.R. 188, 2005 SCC 41 677
Toronto Star Newspapers Ltd. v. Canada, 2010 SCC 21, [2010] 1 S.C.R. 721 685
"Respected teacher had 'dark side,' court told – Kingston man faces sex charges" 699
"Claim allowed to proceed over breach of publication ban" 700

Jan Wong, "On naming names in sexual assault"....701
"[Redacted]: 1 Year Probation for Manslaughter – 2009 draft pick [redacted] talks to Point Blank"....702

11. Access....705
"Justice is blind, and in Ontario, it's also becoming mute"....706
R. v. Canadian Broadcasting Corporation, 2010 ONCA 726....708
Ontario (Public Safety and Security) v. Criminal Lawyers' Association, 2010 SCC 23, [2010] 1 S.C.R. 815....730
Order of the Information and Privacy Commissioner of Ontario – Ontario Rental Housing Tribunal, dated February 7, 2003....746
Order of the Information and Privacy Commissioner of Ontario – Human Rights Tribunal of Ontario, dated October 21, 2010....755

12. Contempt....768
Bert Bruser, "Often my views are unpopular"....769
"A 25 year old drifter"....770
"Seasoned police officers"....771
"It was an easy arrest"....772
"The Toronto police officer"....773
"Cocaine Trial Begins"....774
"Dad faces retrial in baby death"....775
"2 suspects charged in slaying of boy, 11"....776
"Suspect 'well-known' to police"....777

13. Sources and Search Warrants....778
Reid v. Telegram Publishing Co., [1961] OR 418 (Sup. Ct.)....779
CBC c. Lessard, [1991] 3 S.C.R. 421....786
"Judith Miller Goes to Jail"....796
"White House proposes changes in bill protecting reporters' confidentiality"....800
R. v. National Post, 2010 SCC 16, [2010] 1 S.C.R......802
Globe and Mail v. Canada (A.G.), 2010 SCC 41....830

14. Statutory Provisions....851
Criminal Code, excerpts....852
Courts of Justice Act, excerpts....859